

# **Minutes of the first Monthly Meeting of ten Quality Enhancement Cells**

The first monthly meeting of the ten Quality Enhancement Cells was held on December 28<sup>th</sup>, 2005 at 10:00 am in the Higher Education Commission, H-9 Islamabad. The meeting was chaired by Mr. Adil F. Khan, Managing Director of the Quality Assurance Agency.

## **The following attended:**

1. Prof. Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed, Member (O &P) HEC
2. Mr. Adil Farooq Khan, Managing Director, Quality Assurance Agency.
3. Ms. Zia Batool, Program Development Officer, HEC, Islamabad.
4. Mr. Tahseen Ullah , Program Coordinator, QAA
5. Ms. Fakiha Zafar , Training Coordinator, QAA
6. Dr. Abdul Nabi, University of Balochistan
7. Dr. Faqir Hussain, University Of Agriculture, Faisalabad
8. Dr. Naeem Qureshi, Dean QEC, Liaquat University of Medical and Health Sciences, Jamshoro
9. Dr. Jawed A.Aziz, Director QEC, UET Lahore
10. Dr. M. Abdul Azeem, University of Karachi
11. Dr. Aslam Baig, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad
12. M. Azher Naeem, Director P&D, University of Punjab, Lahore
13. Mr. M. Ismail, Director QEC , NUST
14. Dr. Habib ur Rehman, Dean , QEC, Azad Jammu and Kashmir
15. Mr. Raheel Khan, Data Analyst QEC, University of Peshawar

## **Objectives**

- Identification of hurdles in the implementation of Quality Assurance mechanism at universities and finding possible solutions
- Experience sharing among QECs so that they may learn good practices through each other experiences
- Expediting the QEC Staff recruitment process at universities which are behind schedule.

**Agenda of the meeting:**

The agenda for the meeting was briefing by the Head of QECs regarding:

1. The Establishment of Quality Enhancement Cell at the University
2. Implementation of Quality Assurance Mechanism at university during the last six months
3. Utilization of 0.3 million budget
4. Activity plan for the next quarter i.e. from January 2006 to March 2006

**Proceedings**

The meeting started with recitation of Holy Quran followed by the inaugural speech of Prof. Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed, Member (O & P), HEC.

**Inaugural speech**

During his speech, Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed briefed the purpose of this meeting. He requested all the universities to share the problems/ difficulties faced in the establishment of QECs so that solutions may be worked out to address them. He suggested that there should be some bench marks for standardizing the education system in Pakistan and to bring it at par with international standards. The establishment of QECs is one of the many initiatives that HEC has taken to enhance the standard of education in Pakistan. The role of HEC is to facilitate and QAA is a bridge between universities and HEC. Dr. Mukhtar Ahmed recommended frequent communication among QAA and QEC to further strengthen the Quality Assurance activities.

**Presentation by MD (QAA)**

After the introduction of participants, the MD QAA gave a presentation on the present situation of the Quality Enhancement Cells at ten universities. He pointed out that some universities are facing problems and have not yet established the QECs. He informed that Rs.0.3 million has been released to nine QECs and the remaining amount of Rs.0.7million will be released by January 2006 depending upon the satisfactory progress of QECs.

**Presentations by QECs**

The present situation at universities regarding the QEC office establishment, staff recruitment, QA mechanism and future action plan is as follows.

### **The University of Peshawar**

The QEC has been established in the Vice Chancellor Secretariat .This QEC office is being shared with the Director, Vice Chancellor Secretariat. Office furniture and enough office equipment are provided. The post for Dean/Director of QEC has been advertised. At the moment Prof. Dr. Mohammed Arfan is heading the Cell. Data Analyst, Office Assistant, Naib Qasid have been recruited. The QEC has made satisfactory progress. The Quarterly progress report is being submitted. The QEC web page has been developed, linkages are established with various International Universities, a “Mission Statement” and “Vision Statement” has been formulated for the University of Peshawar, “Program Self Analysis-2005” has been developed and approved through Vice Chancellor. A proforma for PSA-QEC-2005 has been developed and shared with all departments; the Proforma for course, program, and student evaluation are shared with the Steering Committee and the Deans of faculties for their suggestions.

#### **Action plan for next quarter**

- Final format of Lesson Planning for the University to be designed in the light of faculty feedback
- Collection of information thorough Student Program Completion Survey, Student Course Evaluation Questionnaire
- The university was appreciated for its efforts. It was also advised to recruit a full time Dean/Director for the QEC as soon as possible.

### **University of Balochistan, Quetta**

A well equipped QEC office has been established at University of Balochistan, all other staff recruitments are made except Head of QEC. Dr. Abdul Nabi is presently looking after the QEC activities on the directives of Vice Chacellor. The university has not advertised the post of Head of QEC. The Deans of the respective faculty have been asked to form Program Team of each department, Students/Examiners Proforma and Assessment Model as per the university’s environment and system of management have been designed and placed on the main page. The QEC Plans to organize presentations to Programs Team of each faculty in March, 2006. The University Vice chancellor and all the heads of institutions are briefed about the Quality assurance system. A webpage for QEC at University of Baluchistan website [www.uob.edu.pk](http://www.uob.edu.pk) has been developed. Model Tenure Track Statutes have been approved by the Syndicate, University of Balochistan in

its meeting held on December 23, 2005. The Director, QEC briefed the Syndicate on Tenure Track System; appointments have been made in this regard. The Quarterly progress report has been submitted to QAA.

**Action Plan for next quarter**

- The QEC will organize meeting with Program Teams at faculty level and collect feedback from out going students.
- The Program Teams will be responsible for preparing a self-assessment report (SAR).

It was advised that as per HEC rules the post may be advertised for the appointment of the Full time Dean/Director of QEC should be advertised on earliest priority bases.

**National University of Science and Technology, Rawalpindi**

All staff recruitments are made and QEC office is established. Quarterly progress report has been submitted. The QEC has dispatch the paper/report on “Guidelines for Self Assessment” by Dr. Abdul Raouf to all NUST Institutions. Roadmap of QA system is being implemented, NUST has joined membership of INQAAHI for the latest updated on the information/Literature on Academic Quality assurance, Post Audit Review Meetings for MCE, NIT & NIIT is held, check list for Institutional Audit program is prepared, data on the NUST Institutional Audit Program collected, Briefing on QA to NUST Academic has been given and formation of Institutional component of QA at local level is in process.

**Action Plan for next quarter**

- Special Academic Audit of NIMS by a Professor from West Texas A & M University, USA.
- Workshop on Innovative and Creative Teaching Methods
- Deliberations on HEC QA Proforma at HQ NUST
- Development of QEC website on NUST portal
- Workshop on improving Teaching / R&D Methodologies

The university is requested to initiate the self assessment system as proposed by Dr. Abdul Raouf as a next stage i.e. formation of Program teams at department level, preparation of Self assessment report etc.

### **Agriculture University, Faisalabad**

QEC office is established but need to be furnished and equipped. The permanent post for QEC was advertised on 23-09-2005 in the National Press. The post of Dean QEC is re-advertised. Suitable persons have been selected for Data Analyst, Personal Assistant (PA) and Peon. The appointment orders will be issued soon. The university has constituted Program teams. An Orientation Program has been conducted for the Program Team on the HEC recommended Guide lines for Self assessment process by Dr. Abdul Raouf. Updates and quarterly reports are sent to the HEC and the Vice Chancellor. The assessment process has been initiated with the start of academic year. A meeting was held with Advisor of Quality Assurance (HEC) when he visited the university and discussed the matters regarding the implementation of the activity plan and establishment of the permanent staff of QEC

#### **Activity Plan for the next quarter**

- Appointment of permanent staff of QEC
- Establishment of the permanent office for QEC
- Preparation of Self Assessment Report of various departments after the termination of current semester on 15-01-2006
- Monitoring of the Self Assessment Report

The university is requested to expedite the recruitment Head of QEC and establish a furnished QEC office.

### **Liaquat University of Medical & Health Sciences Jasmshoro, Sindh**

The university recruited Mr. Naeem ul Haq Qureshi as Dean of the QEC. The Dean QEC is also holding four other permanent posts on the directives of VC. Dean stated that he is facing problems in QEC management and requested for QAA assistance to write to VC to exempt him of additional duties. All other staff appointments have been completed. No proper QEC office is provided by university. As per the meeting agenda the Head of QEC did not present the QEC progress in the establishment of Quality Assurance system. Dean QEC mentioned that he is facing difficulties in accessing the funds (0.3 million) provided by HEC to the university for QEC activities.

#### **Action plan for the next quarter**

- Establishment of Permanent office for the QEC
- A proformas for Self assessment may be developed and shared with all departments asking information.

- Deans of Faculties should be sent a copy of the proformas.
- Constitute a three member Program Teams/ Self-Analysis Team (SAT) comprising of capable and senior faculty members to carry out self assessment of different departments.
- The completed Self Analysis Report (SAR) should be send to the respective Dean of the Faculty and the Director, QEC
- The Director, QEC should conduct meetings with individual Faculty's Dean on mutually agreed days and prepare Executive Summary
- The ES of the Faculties may be presented to the Vice Chancellor by the Director, QEC.
- Outcomes from the SARs and the ES should be used for immediate actions and implementation in the year 2006 University action plan
- The QEC website may be developed
- A sample of departmental mission, vision, objective and goal , Sample of programe objectives and program out comes , Sample of course formats with learning objectives and learning out comes , Course Learning Objectives and Learning Outcomes Correlation Matrix ,Instructor and Course Evaluation Forms may be developed by the QEC( a sample) and shared with all departments for future action.

### **University of Engineering and Technology Lahore**

The university has established a QEC office which needs to be furnished. Provisional appointment of the Head of QEC has been made on contract. All posts are advertised twice but no suitable candidates are found, the posts are advertised for the third time. Due to meager salaries the university failed to attract talented candidates. A QEC office is established which will be furnished in first week of January. A web side is developed. Some changes are proposed in the UET vision and mission. A model for QA mechanism at university has also been proposed.

### **Activity plan for the next quarter**

The Dean/Director QEC identified the following activities for the next quarter

1. Orientation meeting on QA with Deans, chairmen (to discuss QA objectives, QA model, formation of University/ Deptt. Committees/teams etc.)
2. Issuance of directives to departments to initiate self-assessment process.
3. Establishment of student staff Consultative Committee.

4. Appointment of Quality Officers and Programme Directors.
5. Directive to departments to update the prospectus with respect to QA requirements.
6. Distribution of various evaluation proformas to departments to initiate QA procedures.
7. Updating the existing web site.
8. Dissemination of all directives from QAA to departments.

### **The University of Punjab, Lahore**

The present situation is that all the posts of QEC staff are still vacant. The University is looking for temporary arrangements despite the fact that university was informed several times for recruitment of full time staff. The posts for QEC staff are still not advertised which may severely affect the QEC. No separate office for the Quality Enhancement Cell is being established by the university. The university has not yet submitted the quarterly progress report. No progress is being made by the University of Punjab for the establishment of QEC in light of the instruction recommended by QAA. The representative from the university said that the university is already implementing different quality assurance tools under different committees; therefore there is no need for separate QEC.

### **Action Plan for the next quarter**

- Advertisement of all posts of QEC staff
- Recruitment of all QEC staff
- Establishment of QEC office in Vice Chancellor secretariat
- Briefing by Head of QEC to the Vice Chancellor, Pro-Vice Chancellors, all Deans, etc on Academic Quality Assurance and its relevance to the university through workshop
- Establishment of Self assessment system at university as recommended by Dr. Abdul Raouf.
- Dissemination of Proformas by Dr. Amir regarding the students, course and teachers evaluation among all Deans for collection of information.

### **University of Azad Jammu and Kashmir**

QEC office was established before the natural disaster at Muzaffar abad. Head of QEC is recruited. The university has advertised the posts of Deputy Director, Data analyst, office

assistant and Naib Qasid. The Dean QEC ensured that the university foresees no hurdles in functioning of QEC; Dean QEC has submitted a proposal to VC for shift of QEC office to Mirpur Campus. Once the office is established they will start up the activities.

**Action plan for next quarter**

The university is requested to establish the QEC office, complete the recruitments of QEC staff and initiate program and departmental self evaluation process in light of the guidelines by Dr. Abdul Raouf and Dr. Amir Hussain

**The University of Karachi**

The QEC office and staff recruitment is under process. The presented by representative of University of Karachi was not according to the points of discussion for the meeting.

The university is not clear about the QEC and its function.

**Action plan for the next quarter**

Guidelines for the establishment of QEC have been dispatched to the Registrar of the university. Also visit will be paid to the QEC on 27<sup>th</sup> of January 2006 to assess the progress made by QEC. The university is requested to expedite the office establishment and staff recruitments. It was also ensured that once the appointments are completed by January 2006 the Training program will be started for the new incumbents.

**The Quaid-Azam University, Islamabad**

No QEC office is established at the university nor posts for the all QEC staff are advertised. MD (QAA) discussed the matter with Dr. Aslam Baig (Chairman Physics Department, Quaid-i-Azam University) and suggested that the university must take immediate action on the matter. Dr. Aslam Baig agreed that he will discuss with the Vice Chancellor to start initiating and establishing the Quality Enhancement cell. The guidelines for the establishment of QEC are dispatched to the university. Following activities are suggested to the university for the next quarter.

- Advertisement of Posts of QEC staff
- Recruitment of QEC staff
- Establishment of QEC office
- Awareness/ orientation workshop for all university heads on the purpose of establishment of QEC and implement
- Disseminate the knowledge on the mechanism of Quality Assurance acquired by the university in the orientation workshop at HEC on July 25<sup>th</sup> –July 26<sup>th</sup> 2005.

### Concerns of Quality Enhancement Cells

Following are the concerns raised by the representatives of QECs during the meeting for necessary actions at HEC level for smooth implementation of the program.

	<b>Queries</b>	<b>Suggestions</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>Post of Deputy Director</b>	A Post of Deputy Director may be created to improve the function of QEC and to shoulder the responsibilities of Head of QEC. The Deputy Director shall be permanently looking after the QEC Office and its academic programs. The role of the QEC head should be an advisory one.
<b>2</b>	<b>Salary of QEC staff</b>	The Pay Scale of all the staff working in QEC may be revised. Following suggestions were put forward <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The fixed package mentioned in PC1 should be a salary with minimum contribution from HEC; rest facilitation should be provided from the universities.</li> <li>2. In case a Deputy Director is appointed then an amount of Rs: 10,000 per month should be paid to Head of QEC as honorarium and Rs.30, 000- 35,000 per month as salary to Deputy Director.</li> <li>3. The university higher authorities need to be informed about this decision in writing</li> </ol>
<b>3</b>	<b>Head of QEC</b>	The Head of QEC must be a member of all statutory bodies of the Institution so that QEC importance is valued and any item regarding Quality Assurance program could be defended. This must be communicated by the HEC through the Honorable Chancellor. Participants suggested that QEC Head should be a faculty member (working employee of university and integral part of university) with these terms & conditions that his/her first priority should be as Head of QEC with minimum teaching load a second additional duty.
<b>4</b>	<b>Change in nomenclature for the Head of QEC</b>	The participants requested that the nomenclature may be changed as Director of QEC or Advisor to QEC
<b>5</b>	<b>By laws for QEC should</b>	It was suggested that all the legal aspects, structure and authorities

	<b>be incorporated</b>	of QEC office and QEC staff should be incorporated in university statutes/ code
6	<b>Self Assessment Manual/Hand Book</b>	To establish a uniform and standard system through out the ten universities, it is proposed that an academic Quality Assurance Manual / hand book may be developed. Once a system is institutionalized then there will be a snow ball effect.
7	<b>Change the name of QEC</b>	The name of QEC should be changed as Directorate of Quality
8	<b>IT equipments</b>	The universities requested that computer and Printer may be arranged / provided to the universities as early as possible
9	<b>Release of QEC budget</b>	The remaining Budget (0.7 Million) of QEC will be released in January-February 2006 to the universities who made a reasonable progress in the establishment of QEC
10	<b>Quarterly Progress report</b>	It was decided that Quarterly progress report will be submitted by the QECs instead of Monthly progress report because one month is not enough to achieve the targets. But the universities were informed that monthly targets should be identified on monthly basis.
11	<b>Training of QEC staff</b>	Training of QEC staff is required. It was suggested that QAA should call a meeting on development, data entry and time of proformas. In the next meeting of QECs the proformas will be discussed. A Self Assessment Seminar is scheduled in March 2006. An orientation workshop on Academic Quality Audit is also planned at the end of January 2006
12	<b>ISO certified Institutions</b>	Some ISO certified Institutions are not willing to establish Quality Enhancement Cells because they are running a certified system at the universities. Awareness among institutions should be created that QEC is mandatory irrespective of ISO certification
13	<b>QEC budget</b>	The QEC Budget should be at the disposal of Head of QEC and the grant should be managed by the QEC so that the QEC activities e.g. Workshop /seminars and meeting may be organized easily at earliest possible as required. The financial powers may be delegated to QECs through VC of university  Defined break up of the Budget which will be a guide lines for

		authorized expenditures for QEC should be provided since the present breakup is not clearly understood
<b>14</b>	<b>QECs as a regular part of University</b>	If the QECs will become a regular part of Universities next year, it should be communicated to the universities through official letter by HEC higher management
<b>15</b>	<b>Monthly meeting of the QECs</b>	Monthly meeting of the QECs will be held at the end of each month to discuss the last month progress/ actions, action plan for the next month and to find solution to their queries and to discuss any other issue regarding QEC they have.

#### **Actions to be taken by QAA**

The Managing Director QAA has composed /chalked out the following actions points which need to be checked with higher management

1. Deputy Director post and its pay.
2. Rs. 10,000 to the Head of QEC as honorarium.
3. Change of QEC name to Directorate of Quality.
4. Change of Head of QEC name to Director of Quality.
5. Salary to be revised of junior staff of QEC.
6. Legal aspects, structure and QEC office staff to be incorporated in universities status/code.
7. Head of QEC should be a faculty member; his priority should be QEC with minimum teaching load as a second additional duty.
8. Official letter from higher management to VC's of ten universities about QEC to become a regular part of university.
9. IT equipments may be provided to the universities without any further delay.
10. Release of remaining budget (0.7 million) should be completed by the end of January 2006.
11. Talk/write to VCs that QEC budget should be managed by Head of QECs.
12. Quality Assurance manual for QECs should be developed as soon as possible.
13. Break up of Budget will be provided for QECs by QAA in January 2006.

14. To write to VC, Liaquat university of Medical and Health Science Jamshoro to relieve Dr. Nameem. ul Haq of other positions so that he can devote full time on QEC activities and to let Mr. Naeem manage 0.3 million budget provided by HEC to the university.